

Notes by Paul French:

#1 Annabel Lee (Poe)

Source Materials:

There are seven sketches for Annabel Lee in three distinct keys - B minor, C minor, and D minor.

B minor [General Editor: Version 1]

#1) Pencil sketch

autograph / in Collins' hand / Leader Brand paper
this original is in a collection with the song "Fog" [Gen. Ed.: see also copy in FOG folder]

#2) pencil sketch

#3) pencil sketch

autograph / in Collins' hand / no name on MS paper
this original is in a collection with the song "Fog"
appears to be an earlier version of #2

#4) facsimile of ink copy executed by unnamed copyist title of song is misspelled ("anabel")

C minor [General Editor: Version 2]

#5) pencil sketch - the only version in this key

autograph / in Collins' hand / G. Schirmer paper

*a very similar version to that of the B minor #2 setting, with the significant difference being found in the accompanimental figures in bars 59-65.

D minor [General Editor: Version 3]

#6) pencil sketch

autograph / in Collins' hand / Carl Fischer paper

*#6 is more complete in terms of tempo and dynamic markings than any of the other sketches of this text and is perhaps Collin's earliest attempt at setting the text. This setting is the only one containing a dedication, a markedly faster tempo indication than the others, and lastly a dramatically different accompaniment in bars 46-58, and 69-74.

#7) pencil sketch

autograph / in Collin's hand / Leader Brand paper

*D minor #7 appears to be a revision of D minor #6

This Leader Brand edition is an almost exact copy of the C minor (#5) and the B minor (#2), therefore there exists three very similar transposed versions pressing the question should one universal (simply transposed) edition exist in three distinct keys, or should the minor (or relatively minor) changes be retained in each key as Collins composed and adapted them? It is apparent to this editor that Edward Collins, like many a composer, constantly tinkered with his music, leaving behind many performance editions of the same piece. If three separate and distinct versions are printed (engraved), an introductory preface might well be included as to the nature of the differences explaining Mr. Collins' compositional process.

Textual matters

In checking two published versions of the Poe poem and comparing them to Collins' setting for accuracy in punctuation and matters of style, one finds that in the Poe poetry anthologies was customary for the first word in each line to be capitalized:

It was many and many a year ago,
In a kingdom by the sea,
That a maiden there lived whom you may know
By the name of Annabel Lee; (etc.)

Current practice suggests leaving the words in question in the lower case spelling as they were engraved by Phil. As to the matter of punctuation, it makes absolute sense that the engraving contains Poe's punctuation and the following changes should be adopted:

bar 10 ; not . [

bar 12 no ,

bar 15 the word *she* should be italicized

bar 16 the word *I* should be italicized

bar 16 , after the word "child"

bar 28 , after the word "that"

bar 29 , after the word "ago"

bar 31 , after the word "sea"

bar 35 ; not .

bar 40 , not .

bar 42 "sepulcher" not "sepulcher" [General Editor: use Collin's text, but place Poe's text below, in brackets, with editorial explanation.]

bar 47 "For the moon not "But the moon" [General Editor: use Collin's text, but place Poe's text below, in brackets, with editorial explanation.]

bar 50 no , after the word "dreams"

bar 52 ; not .

bar 56 no , after the word "eyes"

bar 58 ; not .

bar 59 , after the word "so"

bar 60 "night-tide" not "night time" [General Editor: use Collin's text, but place Poe's text below, in brackets, with editorial explanation.]

bar 64 "my life and my bride" not "my wife and my bride". Collins makes this error in each of his sketches save for # in C minor where he sets the correct text. [General Editor: use Collin's text, but place Poe's text below, in brackets, with editorial explanation.] Following the word "bride" the original source includes a comma, making the word "in" all in lower case.

bar 66 "sepulcher" not "sepulcher"

bar 67 the final line of this poem reads "by the tide of the sea", not by the sounding sea". In this instance making this change in the dramatic conclusion of the song would require completely changing the rhythm of the melody. This makes little sense.

Engraving Edits

Annabel Lee - B minor engraved version

bar 7	accompaniment	beat 4	D natural in ()
bar 14			sixteenth notes moved closer together leaving more space for the rest of the line
bar 19	accompaniment	beat 4	G# is missing in LH in MS and should be added to engraved copy
bar 20	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - dots too low
bar 21	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - natural on G-natural in ()
bar 21	vocal line	beat 3	hyphen after "my" eliminated
bar 24	accompaniment		<i>mf</i> should read <i>f</i>
bar 25	both lines		according to MS, diminuendo should begin in bar 26
bar 32	accompaniment	beat 2	RH - flat on Eb in ()
bar 37	accompaniment		might be bracketed (quarter, two eights tied, quarter)
bar 38	vocal line		<i>andando</i> as in <i>andamento</i> ? I am not familiar with this term. [General Ed.: <i>stet andando</i> = "going" i.e., moving]
bar 39	both lines		re-align bar so that the final vocal eighth note is not situated over the accompaniment's quarter note
38,40,42	accompaniment	beat 4	beam together as in 44, 45
bar 40	accompaniment	beat 3	LH - flat on Ab in ()
bar 46	accompaniment	beat 2	RH - flat on Bb in ()
52, 58	accompaniment		unclear in Collin's MS - if <i>marcato</i> , then why the slurs, and is <i>p</i> in bar 53 subito or a diminuendo from bars 52-53? [General Ed.: <i>stet, as composed by Collins</i>]
bar 67	accompaniment	beat 6	RH - natural on G-natural not necessary
bar 68	vocal line		beat 1 natural on G-natural from MS not necessary
bar 74-75			though not in the MS, there may be good cause to end this version as all the others have with the elimination of the last measure (adapting the LH accompaniment with a vocal crescendo on "sea" in bar 73 and a diminuendo in the vocal line in bar 74. In either case, the crescendo-diminuendo in bar 74 should be in the vocal part, not in the accompaniment.

Annabel Lee - C minor engraved version

bar 7	accompaniment	beat 4	RH - flat on Eb in ()
bar 12	vocal line		too much space after the word "thought"
bar 12	vocal line	beat 5	flat in () not necessary [General Ed.: <i>stet; alert for augmented 2nd and that accidental is from key signature</i>]
bar 13	vocal line	beat 5,6	F-natural in (), flat on Bb not necessary
bar 17	vocal line		breath mark eliminated - editorial
bar 19	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - flat on Eb in ()
bar 21	vocal line		hyphen after "my" not necessary
bar 23	vocal line	beat 1	flat on Bb not necessary [General Ed.: <i>stet; cancels B natural in m21</i>]
bar 24	vocal line		accent added to "ser"
bar 25	vocal line	beat 5	natural on F-natural not necessary
bar 28			<i>molto dolce espress.</i> in italics
bar 28	accompaniment	beat 1	sharp on F# not necessary [General Ed.: <i>vocal line, not accompaniment</i>]
bar 32	vocal line	beat 4	natural on E-natural on the word "out" not necessary
bar 37	accompaniment		might be bracketed (quarter, two eights tied, quarter) (see note in B-minor version)
bar 39	both lines		the first beat is takes up too much space in the measure - re-align bar more to the left leaving more room for the final eighth note in the vocal line
38,40,42	accompaniment		modify beam over the last beat as two eighth notes
bar 41	vocal line		naturals on A-natural and B-natural in ()
bar 53	accompaniment		beaming would be clearer if as in bars 54-58
bar 54	accompaniment		an indication of the continuing 8's might be necessary as in the indication - <i>sim.</i>
bar 58	accompaniment	beat 1-3	wrong rhythm engraved - it should show eight 32nd notes followed by an eighth note rest
bar 58	vocal line		slur fixed
bar 63	accompaniment	beat 2	both hands - naturals on C-naturals in ()
bar 69	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - flat on Bb in ()
bar 73-74	vocal line		crescendo - diminuendo in vocal line, not in the accompaniment - <i>cresc</i> in 73, <i>dim</i> in 74

Annabel Lee - D minor engraved version

bar 9	accompaniment		LH - accompaniment differs from MS, but Phil's decision is consistent with the other editions
bar 11	vocal line	beat 1	natural on C-natural not necessary [General Ed.: <i>stet; cancels C# in m9</i>]
bar 13	vocal line	beat 2	natural on G-natural in ()
bar 13	vocal line	beat 6	natural on C-natural not necessary
bar 19	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - natural on F-natural in ()
bar 24	vocal line	beat 1	to be consistent an accent should be on "seraphs" [General Ed.: <i>stet; no accent in any source</i>]
bar 27	both lines		a consistent dynamic between the vocal line and the accomp
bar 28			<i>molto dolce espress.</i> in italics
bar 37	accompaniment		might be bracketed (quarter, two eights tied, quarter) (see note in B-minor, C-minor versions)
38,40,42	accompaniment		modify beam over the last beat as two eighth notes
bar 46	accompaniment		8's included for consistency
bar 58	accompaniment	beat 1-3	wrong rhythm engraved - it should show eight 32nd notes followed by an eighth note rest
bar 63	accompaniment	beat 2	both hands - naturals on D-naturals in ()
bar 69	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - natural on C-natural in ()
bar 73-74	vocal line		crescendo - diminuendo in vocal line, not in the accompaniment - <i>cresc</i> in 73, <i>dim</i> in 74

#2 The Bayadere (Collins)

Source Materials

There are five sketches for *The Bayadere* all set in the same (one sharp) key signature

#1) pencil sketch

autograph and dated / in Collin's hand / Parchment Brand paper
appears to be the earliest version of this song

#2) pencil sketch

autograph / in Collins' hand / Carl Fischer paper
unique among the other versions for its many musical directives in Italian

#3) pencil sketch

autograph / in Collins' hand / CFS Co. paper
text written out using all upper case letters

Versions #'s 1,3 are nearly identical, #2 is similar to both of these but includes minor rhythmic and melodic differences

#4) inked copy executed by unnamed copyist / Parchment Brand paper

several corrections in pencil
closely aligned with #2

#5) inked copy executed by S.R. Quick Manuscript, Chicago / CFS Co. paper

copy of #3

Engraving Edits

bars 6,9	vocal line	naturals on G-natural not necessary [General Ed.: stet; alert for augmented 2 nd and that accidental is from key signature]
7,10	accompaniment	beat 2 RH - naturals on C-natural not necessary
bar 13	accompaniment	beat 1 RH - natural on C-natural not necessary
bar 19	accompaniment	beat 2 RH - natural on C-natural not necessary
bar 19	accompaniment	<i>crescendo</i> should agree with <i>molto crescendo</i> in vocal line as the dynamic is already <i>mf</i> , <i>crescendo</i> should be sufficient (which is in agreement with MS #1)
bar 19	vocal line	beat 3 the engraved 64th notes should be evenly spaced
bar 20	both lines	beat 1,3 naturals on C-natural not necessary
bar 21	both lines	a natural (B-natural) should be added to "from her" for clarification of the cross relation with the accompaniment, and a natural also added to the LH beat 4 B-natural
bar 23	vocal line	beat 4 sharp on F# in ()
bar 23	accompaniment	beat 1 RH - natural on C-natural not necessary
bar 24	vocal line	staccato added to D# as in MS #'s 1,3
bar 24	accompaniment	beat 3 RH - natural on the C-natural and C-natural not necessary [General Ed.: crossed out edit reflects basis of correction was in an engraving mistake]
bars 28, 29		the indication <i>dim. ma senza rit.</i> should have even spacing indicating a single directive

3 Butterflies (Collins?)

Source Materials

There are two sketches for *Butterflies* in two different keys

1) pencil sketch in F major
autograph / in Collins' hand / B.F. Wood paper

2) pencil sketch in G major
autograph / in Collins' hand / Parchment Brand paper

Differences between these two versions include a rhythmic shift of the melody in bar 10, as well as rather significant accompanimental differences in bars 1-11, 17, 23-33, 36-38. Phil's choice regarding which version to engrave was a toss-up. I would strongly recommend the G major version be made available (engraved) as a separate edition, as the accompaniment of the non-engraved version is just as valid and interesting.

Engraving Edits

bar 3	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - natural on E-natural in ()
bar 7	accompaniment	beat 2	RH - staccato missing from final note in the figure
bar 8-9	vocal line		<i>diminuendo</i> indicated in MS
bar 11	accompaniment	beat 1,2	both hands - naturals on E, F - naturals in ()
bar 19	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - natural on D-natural not necessary, but helpful
bar 23	vocal line		<i>poco rit.</i> should begin on 1st beat of bar
bar 34-5	vocal line		"sum - mer" has two distinct and conflicting separators
bar 37	accompaniment	beat 2	LH - <i>8va</i> in wrong position - only the final note of the triplet (and the first note of the new bar) are to be played an octave higher.

#4 The Daffodils (Wordsworth)

Source Materials

There are ~~two~~ **three** sketches for ~~Butterflies~~ *The Daffodils* in ~~two~~ **three** different keys

#1) pencil sketch in Eb major

autograph / in Collins' hand / B.F. Wood paper

as pertains to erasures this is the cleanest copy of the set, and it appears to be mainly a transposition of #2 with slight accompanimental modifications (found in bars 57-70).

#2) pencil sketch in Db major

autograph / in Collins' hand / Parchment Brand paper

this version is significantly adapted from #3

#3) pencil sketch in B major

autograph / in Collins' hand / Carl Fischer paper

this appears to be the earliest sketch of the song

Textual matters

In checking two published versions of the Wm. Wordsworth poem and comparing them to Collins' setting for accuracy in punctuation and style (and again finding the first letter of the initial word of each line set in upper case), and again, finding some discrepancy in matters of punctuation, it makes absolute sense that the final engraving move closer to Wordsworth's intentions, so the following changes should be adopted:

title: *Wadsworth* should be changed to *Wordsworth*

bar 3 no . after the word "cloud"

bar 6 , not . after the word "hills"

bar 8 , after the word "host"

bar 9 ; not , after the word "daffodils"

bar 10 , after the word "lake"

bar 12 no , after the word "fluttering", but original reads "fluttering and dancing in the breeze" so this should remain as Collin's intended.

bar 23 , not . after the word "way"

bar 33 original reads "Along the margin of a bay", not of *the* bay". Collins correctly set the text in his earliest MS (#3) offering support that this textual change should be made.

bar 34 : following the word "bay"

bar 36 , after the word "glance"

bar 46 ; after the word "danced"

bar 49 : not . after the word "glee"

bar 52 , after the word "gay"

bar 54 original has : not ! after the word "company", but the exclamation mark is included in 2 of the three Collins' sketches (#'s 1+3) and might be retained here

bar 65 : not , after the word "brought"

bar 68 no , after the word "lie"

bar 72 no , after the word "eye"

bar 74 ; not . after the word "solitude"

bars 78 and 81 Wordsworth's original reads "my heart with pleasure **fills**" not "*thrills*" as Collins set in all three MS. The text is certainly enhanced by the authentic text and the change could easily be made without modifying the musical concerns, but an argument could just as easily be made to leave the text/musical coupled as was Collins' intent. **General Editor: Provide Collins text, with Wordsworth below in brackets, and an explanatory editorial note.**

#4 The Daffodils (Wordsworth) continued

Engraving Edits

bar 2	accompaniment	beat 4	LH - line is in octaves - middle C to be removed
bar 3	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - dot too close to Db
bar 3	accompaniment	beat 2	LH - extra Eb added - should be removed
bar 4	accompaniment	beat 2	both hands - D-natural in (), in beat 4 natural removed
bar 4-5	vocal line		D naturals not necessary
bar 8	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - natural in front of the grace note not necessary
bar 9	accompaniment	beat 4	quarter rest is touching treble clef, and if bar 7 could be a bit compressed there would be greater room for bar 9.
bar 15	accompaniment	beat 1	a bit more space needed between the flat and the roll symbol
bar 16	accompaniment	beat 4	RH - naturals on F, C not necessary
bar 20	accompaniment	beat 2	RH - natural on B-natural not necessary
bar 29	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - natural on D in (), on G-natural not necessary
23-26	accompaniment		A-naturals not necessary, but with the Db's and Cb's it makes a smart editorial choice, though to be consistent throughout this project it makes for a better choice to place the A-natural in bar 23 in (), and eliminate those from the next three bars.
bar 38	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - naturals on D-naturals in ()
bar 39	accompaniment		C#'s and D#'s not necessary
bar 40	accompaniment	beat 1+4	both hands - naturals on E-naturals not necessary
bar 44-5	vocal line		<i>ma sempre allegro</i> need not be in ()
bar 51	vocal line	beat 3+4	staccatos missing
bar 51	accompaniment	beat 1	RH dotted half note D missing from engraved copy
bar 51	accompaniment	beat 1	naturals on D-naturals not necessary
bar 54	vocal line	beat 1+2	Though staccatos are missing from beats 1/2 in this MS, in referring to the Db version (#2) they are present and should be included here in the engraving.
bar 54	accompaniment	beat 4	LH - though Phil set exactly as is found in the MS, the slur after beat four needs to be either tied to the first note of bar 55 or removed altogether. A case can be made for either argument. Consulting the (#2) Db version, though an alternative accompaniment is employed the figure in the fourth beat is not tied to bar 55. Though in the case of this edition it makes better sense to continue the tie to the new motive in bar 55, as is set forth in the example in bars 51-2. [General Editor: connect slur from Eb to F.]
bar 57	vocal line		obvious fix - font problem
65,66	accompaniment		flats on the Eb's in ()
bar 71	both lines		naturals on D-naturals in ()
bar 73	vocal line		C-natural, F-natural in ()
bar 81-2	vocal line		slur not necessary
bar 82	accompaniment		both hands - RH B- natural not necessary, LH in ()
bar 83	accompaniment		<i>diminuendo</i> beginning on beat 4, mirrored in vocal line
bar 85	both lines	beat 1,2	E-naturals in ()
bar 85	accompaniment		<i>crescendo</i> omitted in engraving
bar 87	accompaniment		F-natural in (), A-natural omitted, G-natural in ()
bar 88	vocal line	beat 4	A-natural in ()
bar 89	vocal line	beat 1	natural on G-natural not necessary
79,85,87	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - though not in MS, a quarter rest needed
bar 90	accompaniment	beat 4	LH - quarter rest missing

#5 Death of the Leaves (Collins)

Source Materials

There are two sketches for *Death of the Leaves*, and both copies are have the key signature of four sharps.

#1) pencil sketch

autograph / in Collins' hand / B.F. Wood paper

#2) inked copy

autograph / in Collins' hand / CFS Co. paper

Engraving Edits

bar 3	accompaniment		though not marked in either MS, the down beat G in the RH most assuredly should be G-natural. This is the same accompaniment as found in bar 6 with the G-natural in both the melody and in the RH of beat 1. On Phil's engraved copy the G-natural is missing from beat 4, RH, as found in #2.
bar 5	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - 1st note is G#, not F#
bar 6	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - C#'s not needed
bar 7	accompaniment	beat 2	both hands - G#'s in ()
bar 8	vocal line	beat 1	sharp on G# in ()
bar 8	accompaniment	beat 1	# on G# not necessary, # on C# in ()
bar 8	vocal line	beat 3,4	triplet indication centered over notes
bar 10	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - natural on E-natural in ()
bar 11	vocal line	beat 3,4	I believe Collins uses the word " sap -less", not "saf-less"
bar 13	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - sharp on D# not necessary
bar 21	accompaniment	beat 4	LH - correct notes are G# / A, not E / F#
bar 23	accompaniment	beat 3	a case could be made to add <i>rit.</i> as is found in MS #1 [Gen. Editor: confirm - add <i>rit.</i>]
bar 23	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - dots are missing from dotted quarters, and the whole of the LH notes are incorrectly lined up with the RH
bar 25	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - B-natural needs to be included on alto note and placed in ()
bar 26	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - natural on B-natural in ()
bar 33	both lines		better spacing between text and RH slur
bar 34	vocal line	beat 1	note spelled G-natural, not F double sharp
bar 36	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - # on C# in ()

#6+7 The Faded Violet (Shelley) and Elegy

actual title - On A Dead Violet

Source Materials

This song exists with the same melody in identical keys (six flats) with two distinct accompaniments, are extant as three sketches for *The Faded Violet*, and an anonymous copyist transposed version.

- #1) pencil sketch, entitled *The Faded Violet* - listed as song #7
autograph / in Collins' hand / Leader Brand paper
- #2) pencil sketch, entitled *To A Faded Violet* - listed as song #7
autograph / in Collins' hand / CFS Co. paper
containing minor accompanimental revisions of #1
- #3) pencil sketch, entitled *Elegy* - listed as song #6
autograph / in Collins' hand / G. Schirmer paper
same melody as previous with a wholly different accompaniment
- #4) copyist transposition in four flats
Mel Bay paper

I believe the piece entitled *Elegy* should be returned to Collins' intended key of six flats, and engraved as an alternative setting of the text.

[General Editor: These two related works will both be published under the title "*The Faded Violet (Elegy)*", as Version 1 (titled by composer "*The Faded Violet*") and Version 2 (titled by composer "*Elegy*"), the latter in the key of six flats.]

Textual matters

In checking the original published Shelley version many striking differences appear. It is perhaps best to place the text Collins set side by side with Shelley poem:

ON A DEAD FADED VIOLET

Percy Bysshe Shelley

The odour from the flower is gone
Which like thy kisses breathed on me;
The colour from the flower is flown
Which glowed of thee and only thee!

A shrivelled, lifeless, vacant form,
It lies on my abandoned breast;
And mocks the heart, which yet is warm,
With cold and silent rest.

I weep—my tears revive it not;
I sigh—it breathes no more on me:
Its mute and uncomplaining lot
Is such as mine should be.

THE FADED VIOLET

(Collins' adaptation)

The colour from the flower is gone.
Which like thy sweet eyes smiled on me.
The odour (Fr. *odeur* in one MS) from the flower is flown,
which breathed of thee and only thee.

A withered lifeless vacant thing,
it lies on my abandoned breast
and mocks the heart that yet is warm,
with cold and silent rest.

I weep—my tears revive it not,
I sigh—it breathes no more on me:
Its mute and uncomplaining lot
Is such as mine should be.

These changes, if made, would be significant on one hand, in that they do not represent the intention of the composer. On the other hand, if the changes were made to be faithful to the original text, besides making for a more complete work, no single note would need alteration. This matter is certainly for further study.

[General Editor: The composer may have reference the 1839 edition; see my separate General Editor Report.]

Engraving Edits [General Editor: The versions referenced by the music editor are unclear.]

(The Faded Violet Elegy? -song #6)

bar 1	vocal line	beat 4	note is a quarter note, not an eighth as engraved
bar 1-11	accompaniment		both hands - staccatos missing from all notes, excepting the 16th notes in bar 9. All whole bar slurs missing in engraved copy in both hands
bar 7	vocal line		Phil uses "odor" instead of Collins' "odeur" (as discussed above) [Gen. Ed.: Use Odour, which Collins' used for all but one MS)
bar 15 [17]	accompaniment	beat 2	LH RH - natural on D-natural ()
bar 16 [21]	vocal line	beat 1,3	naturals in ()
bar 17 [19]	accompaniment		all naturals (except E-naturals) not necessary
bar 20 [?]	accompaniment	beat 1	RH natural on A-natural in ()
bar 20, 24 [23?]			staccatos and slurs missing from MS copy, and one could make a case for a similar editing in
bar 25 [27?]	vocal line	beat 4	<i>crescendo</i> from MS missing in engraved copy
bar 30 [32?]	vocal line	beat 1	accent on "mine" missing, <i>indication of f missing</i> , <i>diminuendo</i> missing

(The Faded Violet -song #7)

The accompaniments in bars 12,13 and 22 are different in the two sketches (#'s 1,2). Phil chose to work from #1, the obviously earlier MS, which contains more complete performance indications with regard to dynamics. The versions are not different enough to necessarily warrant a 3rd edition of this text, but from a study standpoint it might be interesting to have all three editions from which to compare.

bar 10	vocal line	beat 2	natural on the D natural in ()
bar 17	vocal line	beat 1	natural on the D natural in ()
bar 17	accompaniment	beat 2	RH - D-natural in (), beat 3 G-natural in ()
bar 19	vocal line	beat 4	natural on D-natural not necessary
bar 20	accompaniment	beat 3	RH - G# is listed as F3 in both pencil sketches
bar 22	accompaniment	beat 2	LH - C#, not C-natural - 4th note of the sextuplet is D#, not F# - in comparing this measure in sketches #1+2 it seems possible that Collins could have meant the final three notes of the 2nd beat sextuplet to be played up an octave.
bar 25	vocal line		<i>teneramente</i> from MS is missing
bar 28	accompaniment	beat 3	RH - Ab above the Eb from MS (2-note chord) is missing
bar 33	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - flat on Bb in ()

[Gen. Editor: A version of *The Faded Violet* in G major was later recovered, and engraved for publication.]

#8 The Fog (Sandburg)

8 The Fog (Sandburg)

Source Materials

There are two sketches for *The Fog* in two different keys

- #1) pencil sketch in E major (key signature = our sharps)
autograph / in Collins' hand / Leader Brand paper
only one original page extant completed by facsimile copy of page 2 - original found in material with *When Soft Voices Die* and *Annabel Lee*
- #2) pencil sketch in C major (no key signature)
autograph / in Collins' hand / unnamed paper
in a set with *Annabel Lee*
- #3) facsimile of a second version in C major (no key signature)

As the alternate C major (#3) version and sole extant copy of E major version put forth a distinctly varied bass line in bars 19-22, there is some justification for the engraving of a second version in E major containing the alternate 4-bar accompaniment. As to the metronome indications at the top of the score, in the various editions, marking of the quarter note equaling 72,76 and 80 exist. It would be advisable to leave the marking (quarter note = c. 72-80) following the composers intentions.

Textual matters

The poem, in its published form reads as follows:

The fog comes
on little cat feet.

It sits looking
over harbor and city
on silent haunches
and then moves on.

One could make a strong case that a similar punctuation be adopted, which would not impair the composers intent. Thus:

bar 11 . after the word "feet"
bar 20 no . after the word "city"
bar 22 lower case "o" in On
bar 23 no . after the word "haunches"
bar 27 lower case "a" in And

Engraving Edits

bar 7,9	vocal line	beat 3	no F-natural necessary
bar 7	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - sharp on G# in () [Gen. Editor: Pf RHH beat 2.25 (third note)]
bar 8	accompaniment	beat 2	RH - F-natural in ()
bar 9	accompaniment		RH - C-naturals in ()
bar 10	vocal line	beat 3	slur missing, triplet centered
bar 11	vocal line	beat 3	C-natural not necessary
15,18	vocal line		breath marks removed (editorial)
bar 19	vocal line	beat 1	C# included and put in ()
bar 19	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - # on C# in ()
bars 1, 7,9, 10, 13-19, 26, 31			fingerings removed (editorial)
bar 20	accompaniment	beat 4	LH - natural on A-natural in graces note not necessary
bar 26	accompaniment	beat 1	both hands according to the MS both grace notes are to be tied to the chord and not re-articulated
30,31	accompaniment		naturals on F-naturals not necessary in () or not

As the careful pedal indications have been marked in the score, and although marked in red pencil, appear to be in the composer's hand, and as though a different matter than fingerings, the *pedal vs. senza pedal* indications (in bars 22-25) are a significant addition to this composition and should be retained in the score.

[Gen. Editor: A version of The Fog in one sharp was later recovered, and engraved for publication.]

#9 To A Little Child (Collins)

Source Materials

There are two sketches for *To A Little Child* in two different keys

#1) pencil sketch in Eb major, dated 9/22/22

autograph / in Collins' hand / unnamed paper
most certainly the initial sketch for the work listing - *words and music by E.C.*
directive in upper left hand corner of page - *tone lower*
Titles of the work on top of page *To A Sleeping Child* and *Lullaby* have been crossed out

#2) pencil sketch in Db major

autograph / in Collins' hand / unnamed paper
Title of word *To A Sleeping Child* crossed out

#3) ink copy in Db major [Gen. Ed.: version engraved]

autograph / in Collins' hand / on CFS Co. paper
composer's editorial markings included in pencil and ink
Title listed in ink as *Lullaby* is crossed out and replaced in pencil with *To A Little Child*
this appears to be a more definitive version

#4) ink copy in Db major

unnamed copyist making a copy of #2 without the composer's editorial additions the accompaniment in bars 14-19 differ from Collins' inked copy (#3)
title of piece is listed as *Lullaby* and dedicated to *Mme. Ernestine Schumann Heink*
it appears as though Collins set the text in his hand into the copyist's setting of the notes.

Engraving Edits [Gen. Ed.: Source #3]

re the measure numbering system, is it more customary to have measure 1 be the first full bar, not listing the anacrusis as bar 1? [Gen. Ed.: Yes]

bar 1-5	bar 0-4	accompaniment	beat 2,4	LH - tenor notes should read Gb and F, not Ab and Gb
bar 3-5	bar 2-4	accompaniment	beat 1,3	LH - tenor added 5th (A) not found in MS
bar 6	bar 5	accompaniment	beat 1,3	LH - bass notes incorrect - Db, not Eb
bar 11	bar 10	accompaniment	beat 3	RH - alto F-natural is missing
bar 15	bar 14	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - natural on G not in MS, should be G#
bar 19	bar 18	accompaniment		fingerings removed (editorial)
bar 24	bar 23	vocal line	beat 4	text should read "thou'rt", not "thou'st"
bar 28-9	bar 27-8	vocal line		Bb and Ab in ()

#10 Magdalene (Collins)

Source Materials

There is only one sketch for *Magdalene*

#1) pencil sketch in one sharp

non-autograph score / in Collins' hand / Parchment Brand paper
text: John 8:1-11 (King James' Bible)

Engraving Edits

bar 3	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - C-natural missing from MS version
bar 4	accompaniment	beat 2	RH - natural on C-natural not necessary
bar 4	accompaniment	beat 3	LH - should read C# as a dotted 8th and C-natural a 16th note
bar 5,6,12	accompaniment		right hand bracket in all bars, or as this is a similar situation to the issue of fingerings in the score brackets are best left out of engraved copy
bar 7	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - G-natural in ()
bar 8	accompaniment	beat 3	RH - natural in front of A-natural not necessary
bar 9	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - D-natural in ()
bar 9	accompaniment	beat 3	LH - D-natural not necessary
bar 9	accompaniment	beat 4	RH - though not found in the MS it is likely that the G natural is actually G# as exists in the LH [Gen. Editor: insert (#) before G on beat 4.75 (continues from G# on beat 1.5)]
bar 10	accompaniment	beat 4	RH - G-natural in ()
bar 11	accompaniment	beat 1,2	RH - B-natural, C-natural in ()
bar 11	accompaniment	beat 2,3	LH - B-natural, C-natural in ()
bar 15	vocal line		Perhaps (most likely) Collins' intent here was that the rhythm of beat 2 and the to be eighth notes as found in the MS, and the dot removed from the syncopated "sees" of <i>Pharisees</i> .
bar 19	accompaniment	beat 4	both hands - D-naturals not necessary
bar 21	accompaniment	beat 4	RH - final sixteenth note is G-natural, not A-natural
bar 23	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - C# and G# missing from MS, should be added
bar 27	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - final sixteenth note is G-natural, not A-natural
bar 33	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - second note of bar is Bb, not Ab
bar 34-37	accompaniment	beat 3	LH - accidentals from beat 1 bear repetitious here
bar 41	accompaniment	beat 1	<i>agitato</i> is missing
bar 43	vocal line	beat 4	text should read <i>their</i> , not "thrie"
bar 52	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - C-natural in ()
bar 58	vocal line		which is more accurate "Neith-er", or "Nei-ther"? [Gen. Editor: Nei - ther]

#11 Music When Soft Voices Die (Collins?)

Source Materials

There are three sketches for *Music When Soft Voices Die* in three different keys

#1) incomplete pencil sketch (only final 5 bars) in A minor
non-autograph score / in Collins' hand / Leader Brand paper
found in materials with *The Fog*
this excerpt is an exact transposition of #2

#2) inked copy in G minor [Gen. Ed.: version engraved]
autograph / in Collin's hand / Parchment Brand paper
composer's editorial markings in pencil

#3) copyist facsimile in B minor
Mel Bay paper

Engraving Edits [Gen. Ed.: these apply to Source #2]

bar 6	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - Bb in ()
bar 7	vocal line	beat 1	flat on Bb is not necessary
bar 7	accompaniment	beat 2	RH - C-natural in ()
bar 12	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - F-natural in ()
bar 13	vocal line	beat 3	tenuto marking missing over <i>dead</i>
bar 14	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - A-natural in ()
bar 15	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - note is touching the flat symbol
bar 17,20	vocal line		breath marks removed (editorial)
bar 18	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - flat on Bb not necessary
bar 21	accompaniment	beat 1,2	G-natural, C# in (), F-natural not needed
bar 22	vocal line		a case might be made to extend the final note of bar 21 to be tied to an additional half note, not simply an eighth note. The change exists in a pencil addition to #2, and most likely in Collins' own hand. [Gen. Ed.: use half note rather than 8 th note]

#13 A Piper (O'Sullivan)

Source Materials

There are five sketches for *A Piper* in two different keys

- #1) pencil sketch in Bb major [Gen. Ed.: Version 2]
autograph / in Collins' hand / Parchment Brand paper
- #2) pencil sketch in Bb major
autograph / in Collins' hand / G. Schirmer paper
- #3) pencil sketch in D major [Gen. Ed.: Version 1]
autograph / in Collins' hand / Leader Brand paper
- #4) pencil sketch in D major
autograph / in Collins' hand / nameless paper
- #5) incomplete pencil sketch (only 32 bars) in D major
autograph score / in Collins' hand / Leader Brand paper
found in materials with *To A Faded Violet*
this excerpt starts with a 2 bar LH drone, unlike the other versions
the marking *unfinished* is written in the left hand corner of the page

Notes

Regarding the tempi indications on the five versions: #1 is listed as quarter note = 126, #'s 2,4 are listed as quarter note = 132, no listing on versions 3,5. It seems more in keeping with the composer's intent that the tempo marking on the engraved score be listed as quarter note = 126-132.

#'s 2,4 are a near exact transposition with the differing accompaniment pattern in bar 61 being the significant difference. #'s 1,3 are, as well, an exact transposition of each other with the D major score (#3) appearing to be (from the many erasures) the earlier score, and the Bb score being a transposed copy used by a lower voice. It is also to be assumed by the subtle harmonic and rhythmic manipulations found in #'s 1,3 as differs (found especially in bars 28-32) that these are most likely the final versions, as it was these chosen by Phil to engrave.

Aware of Collins' practice in terms of rhythmic and dynamic markings, and also aware that the engraved score is, with the exception of the initial *non-legato* completely lacking musical indications, it makes complete sense that Phil add all of the markings found in MS #1 to this engraving of #3, making this a more complete score and certainly reflective of the composer's intent. Beyond these indications, it also makes sense that Phil engrave the alternate version of this song (#1), in Bb major, adopting Collins' rhythmic-melodic adaptations in bars 15, 17, 72, 78 and especially give good consideration to the lengthening of the held note for an additional six beats from bar 45 into bar 46 as found in MS #1.

Engraving Edits [Gen. Ed.: to Version 1]

bar 28	vocal line	beat 6	F-natural not necessary
bar 41	40? vocal line	beat 1	E-natural not necessary
bar 41	40? accompaniment	beat 4,5	RH - E-natural, D-natural not necessary
bar 60	59? vocal line		Ab not necessary
bar 86	85? accompaniment	beat 6	E-naturals not necessary

#14 Prayer for C.H.S. (Thompson)

Source Materials

There are two sketches for *Prayer for C.H.S.* both in the key of B minor

#1) pencil sketch [Gen. Ed.: source score]

autograph / in Collins' hand / Leader Brand paper
this appears to be the earlier "working" copy

#2) pencil sketch

autograph / in Collins' hand / B.F. Wood paper
this is a copy of #1 complete with minor musical indications (dynamics/tempi) changed

Engraving Edits [Gen. Ed.: source #1]

bar 1	vocal line	beat 1	tempo indication missing - should read quarter note = 50-56 (as compiled from both sketches)
bar 8	accompaniment	beat 4	LH - A-natural in ()
bar 10	vocal line	beat 2	E-natural not necessary
bar 14	vocal line	beat 1	D-natural in ()
bar 14	accompaniment	beat 1	D-natural in ()
bar 16	vocal line	beat 3	F# not necessary
bar 16	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - F# in ()
bar 18	both lines	beat 1	<i>subito</i> moved closer to <i>pp</i>
bar 19	accompaniment	beat 2	LH - C# in (), RH - G-natural in ()
bar 20	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - C# not necessary
bar 23	accompaniment	beat 3	LH - tenor half note missing from engraving
bar 25	accompaniment	beat 3-4	LH - style ? - Is it clearer here to have the half note with the down stem, and the eighths up-stem?
bar 26	vocal line	beat 4	C# not necessary
bar 27	vocal line	beat 3	G# in ()
bar 28	accompaniment	beat 2	both hands - the natural and # are touching their notes, more space needed
bar 31	vocal line	beat 2	C# not necessary
bar 34-5	accompaniment		fingerings removed (editorial)

#15 Song and Suds (Tuttle)

Source Materials

There are seven sketches for *Song and Suds* both in three distinct keys

- #1) pencil sketch in G major
autograph / in Collins' hand / Leader Brand paper
- #2) pencil sketch in F major
autograph / in Collins' hand / G. Schirmer paper
original MS found in collection with *Annabel Lee* materials
- #3) pencil sketch in Eb major [Gen. Ed.: Version 2]
autograph / in Collins' hand / Leader Brand paper
- #4) pencil sketch in Eb major
autograph / in Collins' hand / Parchment Brand paper
- #5) pencil sketch in Eb major
non-autograph score / in Collins' hand / G. Schirmer paper
with inked title not appearing to be in the composer's hand in 4/4 time (differing from the 3/2 or 2/2 of all the other manuscripts)
title page marking in ink *more difficult accompaniment* again, not appearing to be in composer's hand.
In reality this is an exact copy of #'s 3,4 with its time values halved
- #6) pencil sketch in G major [Gen. Ed.: Version 1]
autograph / in Collins' hand / Leader Brand paper
original MS found in collection with *Faded Violet* materials
contains an inscription *for Donald Gramm*
- #7) inked copy - copyist, Joe Lorene Miller
exact copy of #6 and closely related (excepting the opening bars) to #'s 1-5

Notes:

#'s 1,2 are closely related in that with minor differences in some musical markings (*molto crescendo* vs. *crescendo*) they are an exact transposition / edition.
#'s 3,4 are also closely related. It appears that #4 is the working copy for the finished product in #3, wherein the scratched out bars of #4 are corrected and copied. As well, the opening 4 bars are altered slightly, but significantly. All musical markings of #3 are underlined in red pencil, perhaps in preparation for performance or publication.
#'s 1-4 are closely related, excepting only a slight rhythmic variation in bars 4-11, and a slight accompaniment expansion in bars 46-51.

One gets the feeling that Collins was searching for the correct beginning to this song. The fact that a Collins pencil sketch exists closely related to a professional copyist's inked version gives credence that versions # 6+7 are the closest to the composer's intention. As #'s 1-5 are so similar it would seem of little value to engrave a version different than the one selected by Phil. As well, the musical markings are consistent between all the versions. Of peripheral interest is Collins' decision not to modify the Tuttle text with regard to the line

*Yes the world is bright though the dress I wear
is scorched a bit and scrubbed threadbare
Yet no heavenly robe ever sung along
more washed in glory or starched with song.*

In #3 Collins substitutes the word "clothes" for "dress" (perhaps not wanting to limit the gender of the singer) and in the earlier version he starts with "dress" then crosses it out and writes in above the staff "shirt" and below the word "clothes". In the end he may have realized that only the word "dress" agrees with the descriptor "robe" later in the phrase.

Engraving Edits [Gen. Ed.: Version 1]

bar 12 11	vocal line	beat 1	"whacks" missing an accent mark [Gen. Ed.: < missing in Version 1, but present in all other sources]
bar 14 13	vocal line	beat 2	"and a" moved more to the end of the bar, not over the half note
bar 14-18 13-17	vocal line		should read "With a Halalu" and a Praise de Lawd" with upper and lower case letters in place and the correct spelling of "Lawd" as found in every other MS
bar 28 27	accompaniment	beat 2	LH - E# not necessary
bar 29 28	accompaniment	beat 1 & 2	RH - E#'s not necessary
bar 29 28	vocal line	beat 1	slur from previous beat is misshapen
bar 29 28	vocal line	beat 1	E# in key signature, not necessary on this note
bar 34 33	vocal line	beat 1	F# in ()
bar 34 33	vocal line	beat 2	slur missing from "swells"
bar 52 51	accompaniment		should have <i>f</i> as in vocal line
bar 54 53	accompaniment		if the D-natural is retained in the bass line, then C-natural and A-natural should be found in the vocal line, as well.
bar 55-6 54-5	vocal line		if <i>rit.</i> is in italics, so should be found the <i>a tempo</i> marking
bar 58, 60 56, 59	vocal line		Lawd", not "Lord"
bar 61 60	accompaniment	beat 1	LH - natural is touching note

#16 The Wooded Lake (Collins)

Source Materials

There are three sketches for *The Wooded Lake* in three distinct keys

#1) pencil sketch in E major
autograph / in Collins' hand / CFS Co. paper

#2) professional inked copy in D major
by unnamed copyist / Parchment paper

#3) facsimile copy in F major
by unnamed copyist / Mel Bay paper

Notes:

#3 is a transposition of #2.

#1 has a different concluding text and accompaniment than #2

The issue of authenticity comes into question, only in that there is no extant autograph for #2 with which to compare source materials

Because of the dramatic change in text and ending from #1 to #2, and having no other source materials by which to make an authentic determination, it makes very good sense both from the musical and historical realm to engrave a second version in E major that employs the alternate ending materials.

Engraving Edits

bar 8,28	vocal line	beat 4-6	is the duple necessary? the duration of the two dotted eighths equal the dotted quarter duration of the half bar. [Gen. Ed.: engrave as tuplet with two eight notes, per current notation practice]
bar 12	accompaniment		RH - C#'s not necessary
bar 15	vocal line		might be better stated as (quarter = eighth of previous) [Gen. Ed.: clarify with standard notice of metric modulation (quarter note symbol = 8 th note symbol) and also use Collins's own narrative direction
bar 15	vocal line	beat 4	in #1 (only autograph) the pick-up is an eighth note, not a quarter note. This change might have some merit as both MS #1,2 are so very similar. [Gen. Ed.: project protocols include assumption that copyist version was reviewed by composer and thus supersedes composer ms; retain quarter note pick up.]
bar 17	accompaniment	beat 1	RH - flat on the Eb is touching the previous note
bar 22	vocal line		<i>rit.</i> moved to before the word "still"
bar 23	accompaniment		the word <i>dimin.</i> is redundant and is not necessary
bar 31	accompaniment		LH - G# is touching note
bar 30-1	vocal line		though in the inked copy the breath marks still seem editorial [Gen. Ed.: project protocols include assumption that copyist version was reviewed by composer]

DEDICATIONS

- #1 - *Annabel Lee* dedicated to Ethel Reid
#4 - *The Daffodils* dedicated to Ethel Reid
#9 - *To A Little Child* dedicated to Mme. Ernestine Schumann-Heink
#14 - *Prayer for C.H.S.* dedicated to Donald Gramm
#15 - *Song and Suds* dedicated to Nancy Carr

The Songs of Edward Collins
edited by Paul M. French
May 1, 2001